



**Stakeholder and Expert Workshop:
INTEGRATED CLIMATE AND DEVELOPMENT SOLUTIONS
CD-LINKS project**

30 September 2015

International Institute for Applied Systems Analysis (IIASA) Laxenburg, Austria

On 30 September 2015 the CD-LINKS project organized a first stakeholder and expert workshop as part of its kick-off meeting. The objective of the workshop was to receive feedback for the project start from key stakeholders and experts in the field, especially regarding the project's near term plans in the area of empirical policy analysis and on how these feed into long term objectives. A total of 47 persons participated in this workshop representing academia, the public sector, NGOs, and the CD-LINKS project partner institutions.

The workshop was divided into three parts: 1) Opening remarks; 2) Priority research questions and activities in light of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), the Intended Nationally Determined Contributions (INDCs) and the international climate negotiations; and 3) Lessons from past policy experiences – How to identify determinants of policy success and failure? This report highlights the key messages from each of the sessions.

CD-LINKS (Linking Climate & Development Policies: Leveraging International Networks & Knowledge Sharing) is a 4-year research project with 18 partners and collaborators from Europe, China, India, Brazil, Russia, Japan, the USA and Korea. The project explores national and global transformation strategies for climate change and their linkages to a range of sustainable development objectives. The four overarching goals of CD-LINKS are:

- (i) to gain an improved understanding of the linkages between climate change policies (mitigation/adaptation) and multiple sustainable development objectives,
- (ii) to broaden the evidence base in the area of policy effectiveness by exploring past and current policy experiences,
- (iii) to develop the next generation of globally consistent, national low-carbon and resilient development pathways, and
- (iv) to establish a research network and capacity building platform in order to leverage knowledge-exchange among institutions from Europe and other key players within the G20.

Part 1:

Opening remarks

After IIASA's welcome and opening remarks, the CD-LINKS project was presented to the participating stakeholders and experts. The introductory session then continued with insights on the **EU and Indian perspectives on integrating climate and development priorities**.

The EU has already linked several climate policies to sustainable development strategies. Further, the issues of competitiveness, employment, trade and environmental effects have been integrated in model-based assessments of climate change mitigation, resulting in better knowledge of the potential development impacts of EU's climate action. Going forward, the challenge is to further develop tools that help analyse and design multi-objective policies within the region, such as, for instance, tools to identify development vulnerabilities related to climate change impacts or mitigation policies.

On the other hand, the Indian experience shows that decision-makers' perspectives need to be taken into account in order to stay policy-relevant as a project. Finding ways of displaying information and providing tool-kits with, for instance, sub-national and sectoral visions could cater for this. Apart from the sub-national and sectoral visions, also focusing on closing the knowledge gaps of specific social issues where information is sparse might be useful in this sense. Finally, it is important to keep in mind that especially in developing countries implementation challenges related to the country context may actually dominate the outcome. In the worst of cases, countries may decide to completely ignore a policy if they do not have the capacity to implement it.

Part 2:**Priority research questions and activities in light of SDGs, INDCs and the international climate negotiations**

The main conclusions of the second part of the workshop, which took place in form of a panel discussion, are summarized into the following four categories:

- **The current context**

The world is moving towards a paradigm shift in terms of integrating climate and development with multiple policy objectives occurring. For instance, the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) link climate and development at global, regional and national levels, and the Intended Nationally Determined Contributions (INDCs) are a result of the currently dominating bottom-up approach of climate negotiations which gives countries the opportunity to integrate mitigation goals with national priorities. The CD-LINKS project can help to provide solutions that are coherent with current needs through conceptualizing the link between climate and development. With its scientific approach, the project can assist countries reach the SDGs and make future INDCs more ambitious.

- **Implementation challenges**

The stakeholders and experts in the panel considered that CD-LINKS is an opportunity to work on a spectrum of global to local issues. Global models were seen as “stylized”, whereas local and national models were referred to as more directly assessing implementable policies. On a global level, the fragmentation of the world makes it more difficult for the project to present integrated solutions. In a local or national context, it is key to understand implementation challenges and that transferring policies from one context to another is very challenging. As already mentioned in the previous category, the capacity of a country or region to implement policies, and their access to finance, can be a determining factor for the endorsement of policies on a local or national level. The expectation of the panel is that the project is able to find ways to create enabling environments that help implement policies.

- **Scope and focus of the project**

Several items were mentioned by panellists as topics that might be interesting to include in the modelling work of the project, these being: innovation, consumer preferences and behaviour, energy efficiency, links to investment needs, development objectives beyond the energy sector, sectoral focus, social implications of carbon policies and second order effects. As a general rule, the panel considered that investigating different sides of the debate will help present fair and competitive outcomes that increase credibility. Further, the project was encouraged to link the research to development countries beyond G20, and on having African cooperation in the project for a more balanced regional representation.

- **Decision-makers**

The stakeholder panel also contributed with ideas on how the project could have an impact and stay relevant for decision-makers. First of all, the objective of the project should be to provide better solutions to decision-makers for the new climate-development paradigm, instead of creating the perfect system (which could be an endless process). Transparency is key for reaching this goal, and it is particularly important to be clear on the limitations of the modelling frameworks (what do they not do and why). Providing more relevant information on social issues might also be useful for decision-making – the wide expertise of the consortium and its connections to different scientific fields will help doing this. Another topic of possible interest for decision-makers might be the creation of market mechanisms that would help increase ambition in terms of mitigation and sustainable development. It is good to keep in mind that the SDGs are to be executed through national and local implementation plans, and accompanying these processes can be seen as an opportunity for the project to become relevant for decision-makers. And finally, listening to the stakeholders that the project wants to influence and involving local stakeholders in the project helps developing good science that answers to the needs of the society.



Part 3:**Lessons from past policy experiences - How to identify determinants of policy success and failure?**

The third part of the stakeholder and expert workshop, which took place in the afternoon, consisted of presentations on policy experiences and was finished by a panel discussion. This session was organized in the framework of Work Package 1 of the project, which addresses the effectiveness of past and existing climate and sustainable development policies through several empirical case studies. The aim of this Work Package is (i) to understand which contextual factors are important for policies to be effective, (ii) to pave the way for policy transfer by comparing the advantages and disadvantages of similar policies across different countries, and (iii) to assemble evidence that can inform the design of future policies to guide national and global transformation processes. The key outcomes from this afternoon session are presented in the following.

Climate and development policies are “young” policy areas in most countries and systematically assessing their effectiveness is challenging and methodologically still underdeveloped. This first of all emerged from the very different perspectives which both presenters and discussants had in approaching the overarching theme of **identifying success and failure** of such policies, and what they deemed relevant thereby. Methodologically it became clear that “success” and “failure” might be categories of limited analytical use, as they are (a) not very well defined, (b) tend to be used subjectively rather than objectively, and (c) categorization in one or the other also differs considerably with context. In that regard it was also stressed that it is important to differentiate between the presumed intentions and the actual outcomes and impacts of policies. **Assessing effectiveness** should concentrate on the latter and relate to the eventual use of results. In terms of understanding why a policy is effective or not, the question if context matters was identified as crucial. In face of all this there was broad agreement of the necessity of developing a common understanding and assessment guidelines tailored to the needs of the project and its primary audience respectively.

The presentations and discussions further provided important input that will be helpful for developing the guidelines for the design of case studies (Work Package 1 of CD-LINKS). First, there is some experience from previous case studies and reports hinting to what could be considered as **good policy practice** in a broader sense: stable institutions including a country’s overall policy framework, policy monitoring and evaluation, transparency, the process of target setting, inclusion of the private sector, and integration of sectoral policies with wider national strategies. In terms of using “best practice” policies in models, it became clear that so far this primarily relates to ambition, such as the rate of increase of renewables in the energy system. However, more work is needed to further operationalize the concept. On the other hand, **barriers** that often prevent effectiveness were identified, namely rent seeking, political opposition, non-supportive regulatory environment, inadequate investments and high costs of monitoring. It was also pointed out that barriers might be specific to policy instruments as for example classified in the IPCC’s Assessment Reports. Second, it became clear that for successfully conducting the case studies also practical considerations need to be taken into account, including (a) deep local knowledge and respective country experts are required, (b) policy data and monitoring is often limited or even unavailable, (c) analysis of the context is very complex and might only be accomplished in the form of a narrative, and (d) not all aspects of climate and development can be assessed, and therefore a reduced subset of highly visible climate and development indicators can be more useful.

To conclude, the stakeholder and expert workshop provided the project with excellent comments, ideas and suggestions right at the start of its implementation, and served as a platform for presenting the project and this way to raising awareness of its objectives among key actors within the fields of climate and development science. More concretely, especially for Work Package 1, the workshop provided hands-on ideas on how to start developing the empirical policy analysis. For instance, the development of the guidelines for case study design was enriched with insights on good policy practices and policy effectiveness.

During the four years of the project, several stakeholder and expert workshops will be organized on topics relevant for CD-LINKS in order to give direction to the project through a science-policy dialogue. The next workshop is expected to take place in Venice, Italy in May/June 2016.

- Attachment: Stakeholder and expert workshop agenda





EU HORIZON 2020 FRAMEWORK PROGRAM - CD-LINKS PROJECT

STAKEHOLDER WORKSHOP ON INTEGRATED CLIMATE AND DEVELOPMENT SOLUTIONS

30 September 2015

Wodak Room, International Institute for Applied Systems Analysis (IIASA)
Laxenburg, Austria

AGENDA

WEDNESDAY, 30 SEPTEMBER

8:15 *Shuttle bus departure from Motel One Wien-Staatsoper to IIASA*

8:30 *Shuttle bus departure from Hotel Jagdhof to IIASA*

9:00-9:10 **Welcome and Opening Remarks**
Nebojsa Nakicenovic, Deputy Director General and Deputy Chief Executive Officer, IIASA

9:10-9:45 **Meeting Objectives and Introduction to CD-LINKS Project**
Keywan Riahi, International Institute for Applied Systems Analysis (IIASA)
[25 minute presentation and 10 minutes for immediate Q&A]

9:45-10:05 **Integrating climate and development priorities: EU Perspective**
Zoi Vrontisi, Institute of Communication and Computer Systems (ICCS)
[15 minute presentation + 5 minutes for immediate Q&A]

10:05-10:25 **Integrating climate and development priorities: India perspective**
Navroz Dubash, Center for Policy Research
[15 minute presentation + 5 minutes for immediate Q&A]

10:30-11:00 **Coffee break**

11:00-12:30 **Session 1: Panel discussion on “priority research questions and activities in light of SDGs, INDCs and the international climate negotiations” (CD-LINKS objectives, gaps, scope, etc.)**
Chairperson: Detlef van Vuuren, Netherlands Environmental Assessment Agency (PBL)
(5 minute statement each) – Invited panelists:

- Tom van Ierland, European Commission, DG Climate
- Prodipto Ghosh, The Energy and Resources Institute (TERI)
- Csaba Kőrösi, Office of the President of the Republic of Hungary
- Luis Gomez-Echeverri, UN Sustainable Energy for All (SE4All)
- Ines Dombrowsky, German Development Institute (DIE)
- John Weyant, Stanford University

12:30-13:30 **Sandwich Lunch**



This project has received funding from the European Union’s Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under grant agreement No 642147 (CD-LINKS).

13:30-14:00	<p>Session 2: Lessons from past policy experiences - How to identify determinants of policy success and failure? <i>Chairperson: Roberto Schaeffer, Energy, Planning Program, Universidade Federal do Rio de Janeiro (COPPE)</i></p> <p>Introduction to CD-LINKS policy analysis and case studies Michael Pahle, Potsdam Institute for Climate Impact Research (PIK)</p>
14:00-14:30	<p>Global Climate Legislation Study Alina Averchenkova, London School of Economics and Political Science (LSE) <i>[20 minute presentation + 10 minute discussion]</i></p>
14:30-15:00	<p>OECD Environment Assessment Ivana Capozza, Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) <i>[20 minute presentation + 10 minute discussion]</i></p>
15:00-15:30	<p>Energy Access Policies: Successes and Failures Shonali Pachauri, International Institute for Applied Systems Analysis (IIASA) <i>[20 minute presentation + 10 minute discussion]</i></p>
15:30-16:00	Coffee Break
16:00-17:30	<p>Panel followed by facilitated discussion on “lessons from past policy experiences and factors determining their success or failure” <i>Chairperson: Roberto Schaeffer, Energy, Planning Program, Universidade Federal do Rio de Janeiro (COPPE)</i> Invited Panelists:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Aleh Cherp, Central European University • Navroz Dubash, Center for Policy Research • Michel den Elzen, PBL Netherlands • Alina Averchenkova, London School of Economics and Political Science (LSE) • Shonali Pachauri, International Institute for Applied Systems Analysis (IIASA)
17:30-17:45	Concluding Remarks
<i>18:00</i>	<i>Shuttle bus departure from venue to Motel One Wien-Staatsoper and Hotel Jagdhof</i>
18:30	<p>Stakeholder Dinner at the Glacis Beisl im MuseumsQuartier (Breite Gasse 4, 1070, Vienna) <i>Upon invitation</i></p>
<i>20:30</i>	<i>Shuttle bus departure from venue to Motel One Wien-Staatsoper and Hotel Jagdhof</i>